

Review of doctoral dissertation
written by Ms. Inna Balahurovska, MA,
entitled: "Development of methodological bases for evaluating the effectiveness of leadership style"
written under the scientific supervision of Prof. SUT Aleksandra Kuzior, PhD., DSc.
and co-supervisor Prof., Hanna Shvindina PhD., DSc.

Formal and legal basis for the review

The formal basis for the review constitutes Resolution No. 43/2026 of the Discipline Council for Management and Quality Studies at the Silesian University of Technology dated 27 May 2026, and the substantive basis is the Act of 20 July 2018 Law on Higher Education and Science (Article 187, points 1 and 2).

1. Assessment of the selection of research issues and the topic of the dissertation

The choice of research direction is determined by the need to improve approaches to evaluating the effectiveness of leadership style in modern organizations. Despite a significant number of scientific works devoted to theories, concepts, and styles of leadership, the issues of comprehensive assessment of the effectiveness of leadership style remain insufficiently developed. In modern theory and practice of management, the effectiveness of the leadership style is considered one of the factors affecting organizational performance; however, existing approaches to its evaluation do not provide a comprehensive analysis of this phenomenon.

The analysis of the scientific literature showed that most existing approaches to assessing the effectiveness of leadership styles focus primarily on managers' behavioral characteristics or specific aspects of their activities. At the same time, the contextual conditions for implementing leadership, the manager's value orientations, and the results of his influence on employees' activities and the organization as a whole are insufficiently taken into account. Fragmentation of the available approaches reduces the objectivity of the assessment and limits the use of its results for management decision-making.

The relevance of the dissertation topic is determined by the need to develop a tool to evaluate the effectiveness of leadership style that combines behavioral, contextual, value, and performance dimensions into a single evaluation system. This approach provides a more complete and objective assessment of the leadership style, establishes a relationship between leadership behavior characteristics and the results of the organization's activities, and expands the possibilities for practical use of the assessment results.

The topic of the dissertation, "Development of methodological bases for evaluating the effectiveness of leadership style," addresses an actual scientific problem: the development of a tool for evaluating the effectiveness of leadership style. A feature of the proposed tool is the integration of qualitative and quantitative research methods, the combination of managers' self-evaluations with employee evaluations, and the consideration of behavioral, contextual, value, and effectiveness components of leadership. This ensures an increase in the objectivity and reliability of the assessment results, allows identifying strengths and problematic issues of leadership, analyzing the relationship between leadership style characteristics and staff performance, and determining priority directions for the development of leadership competencies.

The practical value of the research lies in the potential to apply the developed tool across organizations and fields to evaluate the effectiveness of leadership styles, support managerial decision-making, improve personnel management processes, develop leadership development programs, and enhance organizational effectiveness.

Thus, the choice of research direction and dissertation topic is scientifically grounded and meets the modern needs of the development of management science. The results of the study aim to solve an

actual scientific problem by developing a tool for evaluating the effectiveness of leadership style, with significant theoretical and practical implications.

2. Evaluation of the formal aspects of the work

The dissertation has a logical and consistent structure that aligns with the research purpose, objectives, and rationale. The work consists of an introduction, four chapters, a conclusion, a list of the literature used, and appendices. The total volume of the dissertation is 268 pages, of which almost 200 pages are the main text. The dissertation contains 31 tables, 24 figures, and 12 appendices. The list of literature used includes 405 sources, indicating a sufficient source base for the study.

The dissertation's structure provides a consistent transition from the theoretical substantiation of the problem to its empirical research and the development of a practical tool for assessing the effectiveness of leadership style.

The first section reveals the theoretical foundations of leadership research, systematizes the main scientific approaches to interpreting its essence, and classifies leadership styles. The second section conducts a bibliometric and content analysis of recent scientific publications on leadership issues, which allows us to identify the main trends in research development, systematize contemporary concepts, and form an analytical basis for the empirical part of the work. The third section presents the results of a qualitative study based on semi-structured interviews with managers across various industries. The obtained data were analyzed using thematic analysis and theoretical triangulation. The fourth section presents the results of a quantitative study, performs a statistical test of the obtained data, and develops a tool for assessing the effectiveness of leadership style for practical use in organizations. The sequence of the material's presentation, proper design of tables, figures, and appendices, and a list of sources used ensure a proper presentation of the obtained scientific results.

3. Assessment of the dissertation objectives and hypotheses

The objective of the dissertation is clearly formulated, logically structured, and fully aligned with the current scientific challenge of assessing leadership style effectiveness. It is to develop a tool for assessing leadership style effectiveness that contributes to improving management effectiveness and organizational performance. Achieving this objective involves the development of a practical tool that can support informed decision-making in the selection, development, and planning of leadership strategies.

The research objectives are coherent, mutually interconnected, and fully aligned with the overall aim of the study. They encompass successive stages of the research process, including the analysis and systematization of contemporary scientific approaches to leadership, the examination of trends in the development of leadership theories, the implementation of qualitative and quantitative empirical research, and the development of a tool for assessing the effectiveness of leadership style.

The proposed research hypotheses are logically formulated, internally consistent, and fully correspond to the subject of the study. The first hypothesis assumes that leadership style influences the satisfaction of higher-order needs among employees, depending on the organization's field of activity. The second hypothesis is based on the assumption that each leadership style is characterized by a unique configuration of parameters that distinguishes it from other leadership styles. The third hypothesis concerns the impact of leadership style on employee talent development and overall organizational performance. The fourth hypothesis assumes that empirical analysis may reveal previously unidentified leadership configurations resulting from specific combinations of leadership parameters.

The formulated hypotheses are testable and consistent with the dissertation's research design and methodological framework. Their verification is based on the application of complementary qualitative and quantitative research methods, ensuring the reliability and validity of the findings. Overall, the dissertation's objective, research objectives, and hypotheses are well aligned, correspond to the study's structure, and provide a solid foundation for achieving the intended scientific and practical outcomes.

4. Research methodology

The research is based on an interdisciplinary approach integrating the principles of management theory, organizational psychology, sociology, and economics. This approach provides a comprehensive understanding of leadership and establishes a solid foundation for the development of a tool for assessing the effectiveness of leadership style.

The theoretical component of the dissertation includes a systematic literature review based on publications retrieved from the international scientometric databases Scopus, Web of Science, and Google Scholar. Chronological, comparative, and classification analyses were employed to trace the evolution of scientific approaches to leadership, systematize contemporary leadership concepts and styles, and substantiate the need to improve existing approaches to assessing the effectiveness of leadership styles.

An important component of the research methodology is the application of bibliometric and content analyses. The bibliometric analysis, conducted using VOSviewer, identified current research trends, major thematic areas, and conceptual relationships within the field of leadership studies. The content analysis of the most highly cited publications provided a deeper understanding of contemporary leadership concepts and emerging research directions.

The empirical part of the study was conducted using a Sequential Exploratory Design that combined qualitative and quantitative research methods. The first stage involved a qualitative study based on semi-structured interviews with 22 managers representing different sectors of the Ukrainian economy. The interview data were transcribed, processed using Taguette software, and analyzed through thematic analysis. To enhance the credibility of the findings, theoretical triangulation was employed by comparing the empirical results with relevant academic literature.

The second stage consisted of a quantitative study based on an employee survey. The questionnaire assessed leadership style parameters and employee performance indicators using a five-point Likert scale. Following a pilot study, the main survey was conducted with 227 respondents, yielding adequate statistical reliability.

The empirical data were analyzed using advanced statistical techniques, including factor analysis and Structural Equation Modeling (SEM). These methods enabled the empirical testing of the proposed hypotheses, the identification of statistically significant relationships between leadership style characteristics and employee performance indicators, and the identification of distinct leadership style configurations.

The final stage of the research involved the development of a tool for assessing the effectiveness of leadership style. The proposed tool integrates the results of qualitative diagnostics, managers' self-assessments, employee evaluations, and quantitative measurements of leadership style parameters and effectiveness indicators. This integrated approach provides a comprehensive assessment of leadership style, enhances the objectivity of the results, and supports evidence-based managerial decision-making regarding leadership development and organizational effectiveness.

Overall, the research methodology is coherent, rigorous, and scientifically well-founded. The combination of complementary qualitative and quantitative methods, supported by contemporary analytical techniques and statistical validation procedures, ensures the reliability of the findings and confirms the methodological quality of the dissertation.

5. Conclusions

Based on the analysis, it can be concluded that the dissertation constitutes a complete and independent piece of scientific research conducted at a high theoretical and methodological level. The author has successfully achieved the stated objective, accomplished the research objectives, and verified the proposed hypotheses. The findings demonstrate scientific novelty and practical relevance and make a valuable contribution to leadership research, particularly in assessing the effectiveness of leadership style.

Particular recognition should be given to the development of the tool for assessing the effectiveness of leadership style, which integrates qualitative and quantitative research methods while combining managers' self-assessments with employees' evaluations. The proposed approach has considerable

practical value and may support evidence-based managerial decision-making, leadership competency development, and improvements in organizational effectiveness.

At the same time, several aspects of the dissertation may serve as a basis for further scientific discussion and future research; however, they do not diminish the study's overall scientific value.

During the public defense, it would be worthwhile to address the following questions:

1. How can the proposed tool for assessing the effectiveness of leadership style be adapted for organizations operating in different sectors?
2. Could the developed assessment tool be integrated with contemporary digital HR systems, and how do you envisage its further development in human resource management practice?

These questions are clarifying in nature and do not affect the overall positive evaluation of the dissertation.

Overall, the dissertation deserves a positive evaluation, as it represents a coherent, relevant, and well-substantiated scientific study whose findings demonstrate scientific novelty and practical significance. Considering the relevance of the research topic, the scientific novelty, and the theoretical and practical significance of the obtained results, I conclude that the dissertation "Development of methodological bases for evaluating the effectiveness of leadership style" satisfies the requirements established for doctoral dissertations and that its author deserves to be awarded the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD).

15.07.2026

Irena Svydruk

